

---

BEIJING – APRALO Monthly Meeting  
Thursday, April 11, 2013 – 13:00 to 14:00  
ICANN – Beijing, People’s Republic of China

MATT ASHTIANI: This is Matt Ashtiani for the record. Today is Thursday, the 11<sup>th</sup> of April, 2013. This is the APRALO monthly meeting. Please remember to say your name before speaking. Please remember to speak into the microphone. And please remember to speak at a reasonable pace. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: This is Holly Raiche for the transcript records. I would like to welcome you all, and Heidi has a task for me which she would like me to do. Thank you. On behalf of Olivier, there was a little ceremony that some of you attended with the most delicious cake, that we all celebrated ourselves, and we celebrated three really hard working people, who have made a terrific start.

I was actually shocked that Rinalia wasn’t one of the three. But we... No, no. But since Cheryl actually is worked on really hard on the rules of procedure, as has Alan, and we also know that Dev got the prize – for those of you who weren’t there, and did not have the cake, this is for Cheryl, and for her work. [Applause] [Laughter]

The next task that has Heidi has for us before we have the meeting, is she wants me to get rid of what? All of those brochures. She forgot. Heidi would you like to take the floor? Thank you.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi, thank you. We're going to be bringing down the APRALO brochures in English and in Chinese. And we ask that you please take them home with you for your outreach and engagement activities. You also have a lot of pens left over for APRALO, and business cards.

So we're just going to be giving them to you because we cannot take them back home with us. And also, they are produced for you. And now that you're going to go out and get new members and engage with your community members, this is a really opportune way to do that. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: And furthermore, none of you are getting out of here unless you take some. So that's it.

HEIDI ULLRICH: And we have now Cheryl, a glossy gift here. [Applause]

HOLLY RAICHE: Oh, lovely.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Now moving right along to the agenda, which is posted, thank you very much Matt. I don't think at this late stage we need to introduce each other, and if we do that's because you haven't been attending enough

---

meetings and you should utterly ashamed of yourself, and you will be noted.

And speaking of that, we're going to go around the table and everybody is going to actually indicate who they are, so I know who is here and who is not. Let's, actually we'll start – we'll go around this way.

MAN: Hello everyone. I'm [? 0:04:02], Internet Society [? 0:04:03] Chapter the ALS.

MAN: Hello. [? 0:04:12]...

MAN: Hello [? 0:04:17] I come from ISOC type A.

JOSEPH: Joseph [? 0:04:23] from ISOC Hong Kong.

MAN: Yeah. [? 0:04:28], Internet Society [? 0:04:31] ALS.

MAN: [? 0:04:34] ... also present Professor Hong.

MAN: [? 0:04:40] At-Large Management Society. From Jordan.

---

JERRY: Hello. I'm Jerry [Tam 0:04:48] from Net Mission dot Asia.

WOMAN: [? 0:04:53]

MAN: [? 0:04:55] co-chair of APRALO.

MAN: [? 0:04:58] Society.

WOMAN: [? 0:05:02] Internet Action Group, ALS.

MAUREEN: Maureen [? 0:05:08], ISOC.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche. The Internet Society for Australia.

RINALA ABDUL RAHIM: Rinala Abdul Rahim. ALAC member from Asia Pacific.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich. ICANN staff.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Cheryl Langdon-Orr, ISOC AU.

MATT ASHTIANI: Matt Ashtiani, ICANN staff.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

WINTHROP: Winthrop [? 0:05:35], ISOC Philippines.

WOMAN: [? 0:05:37]

MAN: [? 0:05:42] I'm from new ALS.

MAN: [? 0:05:46], ISOC Balham.

WOMAN: [? 0:05:50], ISOC AM, ALS.

MAN: [? 0:05:55] Armenia Education Center.

EDMON CHUNG: Edmon Chung, ISOC Hong Kong.

---

MAN: [? 0:06:05] ISOC India.

MAN: [? 0:06:08] India.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you everyone. Sorry? Could you cover the line?

MAN: [? 0:06:26] from ISOC Taipei.

MAN: [? 0:06:32] ... Taiwan.

HOLLY RAICHE: [? 0:06:35] is about to identify herself, she's rushing here, sitting down, thank you very much.

WOMAN: [? 0:06:45]. I'm in the Association for the [? 0:06:49], and nom com member from APRALO. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you [? 0:06:58]. The next item, Rinalia has to leave at 1:30 so she's with my indulgence, because I'm a nice guy, is going to actually combine items two and four, and then we'll get on with the rest of the agenda. Rinalia?

---

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you Holly. Rinalia Abdul Rahim for the transcript record. I've been asked to run through some of the events or meetings that have happened in ICANN 46 in Beijing for your benefit in case you have not been able to attend some of them due to the parallel sessions that have been held.

And so, I've highlighted a few things that I would like to bring to your attention. The first one is that there was a high level meeting on regional strategy for the Asia Pacific meeting that happened on Monday, April 8<sup>th</sup>. And what I wanted to say was that the At-Large voice was not included in that strategy discussion in terms of the panel that was put together by [? 0:07:57].

We were just not there. APNIC was there, APTLD was there, and ccTLD from Australia was there, and some Chinese companies, but we were not there, and we were not invited. And I have expressed our displeasure, if you will indulge me, to the ICANN CEO about it, because I felt that any development of a regional strategy, the At-Large must be represented.

So that's one point.

HOLLY RAICHE: Could I actually ask do... Rather than simply you expressing it, is this something that as ALAC chair and on behalf of all of you, I should actually write a statement to Fadi saying, "We understand this is taking place. We all represent the region, and we should have been there and we would like a briefing."

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Cheryl here. Holly I think it would be a co-signed letter. I believe Olivier, who is in fact the ALAC chair, and yourself as the APRALO chair should do exactly that. This is absolutely unacceptable in the extreme. And it might be an idea to make sure in that letter, the attached PowerPoint slide of the roll call is there, so that the diversity, the talent, and the quality of the material people that they have summarily dismissed in their ignorance is in their face.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. I will take it up with Olivier, and if I'm not going to take a vote but is there anybody who thinks I should not actually with Olivier write and say, "We should have been there." Because I think we should have been there.

And what I will do actually is ask for a report of that meeting, which I can then circulate to everybody, so that we will know what was discussed, and we will be able to report back to our own members as to what was discussed. And I'm taking up too much of Rianalia's time, I apologize. That was Holly Raiche for the record.

RIANALIA ABDUL RAHIM: And now it's Rianalia Abdul Rahim for the transcripts. Following on the Asia Pacific strategy, the ALAC ExCom had a breakfast meeting with the ASO, the addressing supporting organization of ICANN. And we have been having talks with them over a span of many ICANN meetings, because we wanted to have closer regional relationship between the RALOs with the RIRs.



---

And it has come to our attention that the engagement is happening in some RALOs, but not in others. In LACRALO, the cross-pollination of interaction is happening between the LACRALO and the LACNIC, but not in APRALO. So my request and advice for the APRALO members here is that if you know [UP NIC 0:10:45], then we need to insist that they invite the APRALO members to their events and actually start engaging in our community more, because we are being under-utilized and we're not benefiting from this.

HOLLY RAICHE:

I personally know, as does Cheryl, Paul Wilson and... Holly Raiche for the transcript records. And I'm quite sure that if he knows that we would like to be informed, I'm sure that he would do it. But again, it's probably letter number two.

WOMAN:

[? 0:11:27]... for the record transcript. I agree with APNIC to include APRALO region, but I will like to trace your attention on the region which we are representing. So Armenia is quite far from APRALO, but we turned out to be in APRALO.

So we should deal with that somehow. I would like to ask to request for sharing this information, probably APRALO mainly is that there are [APNIC 0:12:00] coming, there are kind of events where even if we are not physically able to go there, at least we can follow remotely. Just don't forget us.

---

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you. This is Rinalia Abdul Rahim. Yeah. I co-chair, we won't forget you. And I think that you might even have flexibility of dealing with two RIRs, maybe more at your preference, but it is also dependent on your initiative. Okay.

Proceeding onwards in terms of sessions or issues that I would like to flag for your attention. Sorry, Edmon you wanted to say something?

EDMON CHUNG: Yeah. This is Edmon Chung. I'm just, on the APNIC side, I just wondering what, to clarify, what exactly you're looking for and how, what are the steps we're taking to do that?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Okay. In response to that, and you just reminded me, Matt we actually need an action item that there is follow up from the RALO chair level to Paul Wilson in terms of cross engagement. What we actually want is for the RIR to invite APRALO members to their event, to participate in their meeting as well as workshops because our members could benefit from the capacity building activities that they have.

And they also have a fellowship program whereby they can probably provide travel support either fully or partially, depending on their criteria. And I ask them specifically, what is it that you get from engaging our community? And the response is that they want cross-pollination of people to serve in their specific positions and roles, they have official roles and officers or whatever, and they would like that to come from our community, and it's their way of getting new blood.

---

It's like nom com reaching out and bringing in specific people. So there is synergy and benefit. So can I have that action item on the list? And I will just proceed. Yes, sorry.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Cheryl. Very briefly. Just if anybody is wondering about the degree of commitment and engagement, remember that with the number of support, the number organizations, things happen on lists. Okay?

So you can't actually get engage in policy and be very effectively involved because decisions and things happen on email lists, so it's not as if there is a lot of requirement for you to be doing travel, or to be going to many meetings.

There is a lot of contribution that you can be making throughout the year. And then of course, if there is something nearby obviously we would like to have you involved.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you. This is Rinalia again for the transcripts. I'm looking at all the sessions that I have attended for the week, and I'll just flag a few more. There are three survey or input requests from the community. The first one is actually the At-Large new gTLD working group outreach and evaluation.

Basically they are trying to figure out why there was such a low number of application from developing country, emerging economies, specific language communities perhaps. So their developing a survey, and if you

---

could help them in terms of reaching out to more people who could give a response, that would be helpful.

That's number one. The second one is the ATRT 2, that sounds like ARDT in *Star Wars*, but [laughter] it's actually the ICANN accountability and transparency review number two for ICANN. It's mandated by the affirmation of commitment and extremely important for the continued legitimacy of ICANN.

And they also need feedback with specific questions that they have put out. So please have a look at their website, see if you could spend some time to contribute input and encourage your community members to provide that input as well. I'm trying to see which other ones.

I think those are the two surveys, and of course there is currently a survey on ICANN's reputation and image. I think we saw that in the beginning being presented, but now they want to roll it out to more people. And I would expect that they would try to reach out to you.

And if you have that opportunity, please give it back to ICANN, that would be very helpful for them. Yes.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Just a question. Are there links to these things that we could actually email to people?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM:

This is Rinalia. Staff has confirmed that there are links and they will email it to APRALO. Thank you. And in terms of all the working group meetings that have happened, I would like to flag that the IDN working

---

group session yesterday, which happened very late, but it was very intense I would say, with more experts in the room than there were community members.

But the topic was very hot, it was about the trademark's clearing house and the model not being able to handle IDN variance, whether deliberately or not deliberately. I don't know. But the ALAC has agreed that we would issue a statement about this formally, and that a short statement of support in today's public forum.

And I think that's very relevant to our region, so we will take that up as a priority. That is all I have in terms of things I would like to flag for your attention. And I will just move on to the IGF, that's the Internet Governance Forum, and the Asia Pacific Regional governance forum that is being planned for this year.

The IGF happens in Bali in October, and the Asia Pacific Regional IGF is happening in Seoul, Korea in September. For the IGF meeting, I have submitted a proposal on behalf of APRALO to address the IDN variance issues. Just like the APRALO multi-stakeholder round table session, as a follow up to that.

I don't whether they are viewing it positively, but in the event that they do, then we have the opportunity to follow up and expand on those issues. And bring the matter to the attention of more people in the internet governance community, which will actually bring more language communities to the table because there languages are currently not being addressed at all.

---

So we will keep you posted in terms of whether or not ICANN is willing to finance the APRALO's session, and yes, status will be provided. In terms of the Asia Pacific IGF, I'd like to invite [? 0:18:27] to say a few words, because she is the host.

WOMAN:

Yeah thank you Rinalia. [? 0:18:32] for the record. One of the specific nature of this AP [? 0:18:38] in Korea is, we are going to combine side event of the cyber space conference, which will be hosted in Korea as well in October. So one of the side event of the AP IGF and the cyber space conference will be the user forum.

I understand some of the net mission people who are coming from the users community are also attending this meeting. So we are going to like promote more participation from use. And we do some kind of essay test about the cyber space topics. And those who are selected for that essay test, will have some financial support to attend the forum.

And out of those whole participants, three delegation will be selected to participate in the planetary session of the cyber space conference, together with distinguished panelist. So this is going to be a very big deal for the use who are interested in connect [? 0:19:41].

So I'd like to welcome the user participation, and hope that ALSs in this meeting to spread this word in use of your own nations and ALSs like that. And so at this time, we would really like to have more participation from the use and then the other stakeholders, especially government, who have not been attending the IGF events, especially from Asia region.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you RJ. Rinalia, do you have any further report?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: I don't have any, but Susan [? 0:20:28] have joined the meeting, so perhaps she should record her attendance. Hi please come forward, please.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks Rinalia. Maureen?

MAUREEN: Hi everyone. I'm Maureen for the record. My section is on the Beijing events [laughs]. I would really like to use this opportunity to say thank you to everyone who helped to make the events that we were in, that we've run during this meeting a success.

I know that, for example, we all got sort of railroaded into this, into the organizing committee just after Toronto, and I think under Holly's leadership, in the regular meetings which sort of like started off monthly, at the end of last year, and then fortnightly from January, and then sort of like weekly or twice weekly, running up to the event.

I think the very first thing which I felt was really awesome was the fact that when the messages started going out to the ALSs, that the responses were great. Getting those photos, as you saw, getting those photos the brief descriptions, were really, really important.

I mean, as Cheryl has actually sort of like stated, that little pub wink would be quite an influential little document about the APRALO ALSs,

---

and what it is. The diversity within our region very well expressed I think in that document.

And so getting that information was really awesome, just the sharing of information that took place before we got here was really great too. Also of importance was that feedback. I know not everybody did it, but then again I know that there was some very experienced...

We had a big range from no, first time ICANN attendance to people who, like these guys who have positions on the, within the hierarchy of ICANN already. But it was really good to get that feedback on that quantified scale about what people knew about ICANN.

Because I was actually able to feed that into Janice. And Janice was able to sort of like pull together, along with the program, the fantastic program, as I mentioned before that she usually organizes for the fellows and the newcomers to ICANN. But it really did sort of like confirm the sorts of things she was providing in the program and that it could add value to what we're trying to achieve for our ALSs.

Be prepared, I'll be sending out another very short survey, because I would really like to get some feedback from ALSs about sort of like what you think you got out of this week that might help with future events that we provide for ALSs. And that's not just at ICANN meetings, it could be regionally as well.

But I would especially like to thank, and I think we should all put our hands together for Edmon who provided the sponsorship for a lot of the events that we showcase event. That would not have been possible if



---

we hadn't had his backing, and I really do... Dot Asia, thank you very much.

And also to [? 0:24:47] who is around. He was great, he was great, absolutely superb support for getting emails and things out for me. That was superb as well. So with the showcase, capacity building...

HOLLY RAICHE: What about the mutli-stakeholder?

MAUREEN: Well, I was hoping that Rinalia might mention that. But there was, on a similar sort of like vein, she sent out messages getting some, seeking information about sort of like topics and speakers, and she put together a really fantastic program.

HOLLY RAICHE: Actually, Edmon you are here. Now what was your impression of, at least the IDN section of the mutli-stakeholder forum?

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you Holly. Edmon here. I think actually, not just the IDN one, iw as here for the gTLD one as well. I think both of them are very, it was actually very well attended and we did touch on things of substance. A number really of the items that were discussed, I think there are some take a ways and some action items on it, which is encouraging.

---

So I don't know whether this was done for other RALOs, but certainly it's something that we should not only continue, we should expand in our future sort of occasions where we could do those type of things.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you. And I'm just going to take up what you said, there is some take a ways. One of the last things I want to do, if... Are you finished? Is to say what did people actually get out of the past four days that we should follow up. And I think there are a number of topics. We've talked about, for example, outreach and what have people have learned.

We've spent a lot of time, which I thought was very interesting, on what is an ALS. Is it an individual? What do we mean by that? is there another issue that has come out? Form Dev's working group, which was about technology, how could we better use technology to actually provide more information about ourselves?

How can we use the Wiki? How can we perhaps post pictures of ourselves? Post questions? Those sorts of things. So how can we have some take a ways from the days that we've been, so that we can actually be more effective? And I'd really be interested to hear people's thoughts.

I just want to go around and sort of think, well what for you were the highlights? And what is it in APRALO we can or should be doing to enhance what we do? So [? 0:27:56] do you want to start and then Edmon follow? Just go around the table. Which will take up probably

---

most of the time, but that's – I would like to get some feel about how all of you saw the last four days, even though you're probably a little tired.

MAN: Yeah. Thanks. This is [? 0:28:16] from [? 0:28:17] of India. This is my first...

MATT ASHTIANI: Please remember to speak slowly.

MAN: Sure. My first visit to ICANN, although I have been at a meeting in Algiers, there is an overwhelming amount of complexity and detail, which makes it somewhat foreboding for a first timer. But once you get past the initial hurdle, I find that once you focus on your own areas of interest, you can actually start linking and leading to the content.

I think I'll stop with that. Thank you.

MAN: Yeah. Hi this is [? 0:28:59] ...India. Before I sharing my experience, I want to bring to notice two items for everybody's interest. I attended, locking of domain names subject to UDI proceedings today, and there is a working group being constituted which is working on this.

And there was a detailed discussion on privacy laws, and I would feel that the whole group of, the WHOIS of the working group will be very interested in joining that as well. There was nobody from APRALO was there on the working group. So in case anybody wants to...

---

I have the contact details of the individual to whom you have to write. I can mail to her, but for the purpose of the transcript, it's [? 0:29:41] from ICANN. That is item number one. And second, I also would like to propose an action item. This outreach brochure has been shared, which is in English. The latest statistics in India have suggested that there will be internet penetration at the rate of 15% annually, and most of it would come from the rural area, who are not English savvy.

So I would like to propose as an action item if you can have a Hindi version of this, for the [? 0:30:14] it would be really great. And I'm all there to help out.

HOLLY RAICHE:

First of all, may I suggest you send around the link for the working group, because that sounds like something we should absolutely follow up on. What Matt is putting up, and it's a reminder to me, should be a reminder to you, there is a work space for meeting reports.

And it would be really, really helpful if all of you would have a look at what meetings have you attended in terms of just even a kind of, this is what my take out is on that meeting. Not sincerely the meetings we've had with each other, but if you've attended other meetings that we should know about, all of you.

There is a place to put it. Now if you can't find it, or you can't insert the text, send it to Matt, Matt doesn't have enough to do, he will [laughter] he loves to put stuff into spaces. And he does it anyway. But my suggestion is that you put something there as well. In terms of language, I saw how his eyebrows kind of knit very tightly and say no.

---

It's okay. Talk to Heidi, she usually makes things happen if it's at all possible. So have that conversation off line. We have, in the past, published documents, sorry APRALO documents in a number of languages, so have a word.

MATT ASHTIANI: So this is Matt for the record. I'll go up and talk...

HOLLY RAICHE: If APRALO, whisper in my ear. If APRALO says yes, then she can take it back, and it will happen in Hindi. Does everybody think that this should happen? Thank you. Heidi? She hears you.

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi. I hear the request from APRALO to develop an APRALO brochure in the Hindi language.

MAN: Thank you very much. Thank you very much.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Should that be an action item? Okay. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Edmon do you have anything to add that we should be aware of?

---

EDMON CHUNG: Just I guess quickly, as we prepare this, I think one of the things that fell through the cracks was an use session that was mentioned in Toronto, and that mission team took up and put together. Eventually it did happen for those of you who did join us, thank you for joining.

And I think it was a very exciting session, so as we go forward in future planning, I think we should definitely, if not keep that particular item and make it a work for us.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thoroughly agree. Thank you. And it's Holly Raiche. I've got to start saying Holly Raiche, I just won't speak.

MAN: This is [? 0:33:17]. I think from my opinion, it's important to involve our local community in this discussions. Because usually even advanced people don't know that they can somehow can contribute their thoughts, etcetera.

So because this technical issues can be solved another problem how to involve people, and this kind of things to have is good, and it's good to have something also in digital way, etcetera, to know that we can share something among our communities. Because just an example, we have just after a month, a huge event. [? 0:34:16] Youth will come and a lot of people which are interesting.

Just to have something to involve them, to encourage, to spread interest. Thank you.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you [? 0:34:29] know that we do have the brochure in English and it's digitally available. Could I suggest you talk to Heidi to see what else you might need so that you got... First of all, you're not going to get out of here without actually taking away some brochures and a whole bunch of stuff.

But [CROSSTALK 0:34:51]... okay. If there is anything else, I've got pens, so you can get rid of the pens. Whatever.

WOMAN: Give them information.

HOLLY RAICHE: If you need other things that would be great, and I know that the brochures... In fact, the brochure was available on our part of the website in Chinese. So we can put it up in other languages if that helps. Okay? Could you check with Heidi? But I think we can probably do that. Next.

MATT ASHTIANI: Yeah. We'll be able to post it.

HOLLY RAICHE: Matt would be very happy to send it to you.

LEANNA: Just about the brochures. If... Leanna [Goldstein 0:35:39] from Armenia. Just about the brochures. Since everyone... I think most of you have

---

good experience of a long period of participation, maybe you could share if it is of assistance in the community to disseminate this information, the brochures.

And just about Hindi, if it is not difficult [laughs] maybe Maureen as well, really I promise to make the translation of all this information, because not everyone knows English. I know this is a challenge, but in a lot of language, it will be disseminated in a broader way.

HOLLY RAICHE: Heidi do you want to... Holly Raiche for the transcript record. Heidi do you want us to, as an APRALO, take a vote? Do we want this in Armenian as well? This temperature of the meeting, we do this by putting our hands up.

WOMAN: We need to cope with this diversity [laughter]

HOLLY RAICHE: We're not voting, we're just saying, do we think this is a good idea? It is a lovely idea. We're very happy with this idea. Thank you.

[AUDIO BLANK 0:36:58 – 0:37:11]

HOLLY RAICHE: That wasn't a vote. [Laughter] Edmon.



---

EDMON CHUNG: Edmon here.

HOLLY RAICHE: You're not voting by the way.

EDMON CHUNG: No I think, since we've heard from a couple of languages, we probably should do, as we go along, instead of doing it every time as we go along, we should collect the set of languages that we need to. If we would need to ask from staff whether we need to prioritize, when we need to prioritize, then we need to come back and make some decisions.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche for the transcript records. I think there is a limit to the resources to the... I think we'll start with Hindi, because unfortunately you weren't first. I think there is... I think we've got to over time, in a very short space of time, start basically to have at least an initial document that you can hand out in local languages.

I think we all agree, and I think it's always going to depend on the resources of ICANN. Well, unless, Heidi could they do it... If we gave English, do we want to give them English version and have them translate it? That might be dangerous.

HEIDI ULRRICH: This is Heidi for the record. Just in the short term, and I'm just looking at my technical expert here, what we could possible do is that... Now

---

again, all of these brochures are in PDF format on the APRALO Wiki page. We also have them in Word, so we could do that.

Our Wiki pages have a translation tool, I'm not sure if Dev told you that. Okay. So there is a translation tool. Okay. I know. But what we would do is just take, literally cut and paste the text from a Word document of the APRALO brochure, it won't be pretty but the text could be then translated using the Wiki translation tool.

So that, in the short term, that's one solution. And again, it's a great translation tool. It has many languages of the world, so you might consider that. And we're happy to show you, you can just send us an email and we can show you how to do that. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

That's certainly one solution. I think... Look, you've got the text in English anyway, so and I think Edmon is right. I think over time what we do want is to develop brochures about ourselves, but it's time intensive, it's resource intensive. But I think we ought to have a program whereby, over time, we won't end up with a range of documents in a range of languages, because we represent so many languages.

Speaking of which, we're about to come to [? 0:40:06].

MAN:

[? 0:40:09]. This time I'm very much happy with my attendance with ICANN because the third time, I've just been engaged rather than just getting a receiver. So before attending the ICANN, since the last ICANN meeting in turn, I was part of the Middle East Strategy Working Group,

---

which have developed an initial document and we have showed that on the presentation.

And I've joined as well the Building Capacity Working Group with At-Large, which I'm happy with. Even [? 0:40:44] as individual experience for ATRT, but it didn't happen, but hopefully next time. So this time, I'm very much engaged rather than just being a receiver for the info. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Holly Raiche for the transcript records. I'm delighted, just delighted. And follow this man's lead is all I can say. [? 0:40:08], who is already following a lead. Now he's, from the newbie perspective please.

MAN:

Hi, I'm [? 0:41:14] in the Pacific Islands. Basically I have a technical background, so I was really interested in what Dev was talking about in terms of his work, especially to do with the Wiki, and I've already offered my assistance to help him in his task force group as well.

And just anything that I can be of help around the ICANN. And this is of course my official ICANN, if the transcript can show this. This is [? 0:41:48] it's my first official ICANN. I've been to a lot of ICANN's since 1999, but I'm officially, while I've been registered, but I never attended any meetings, I was here to meet the people who actually run the internet for [? 0:42:04] that is based in America. Thank you very much.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you. I'm going to caution everybody, we've got ten minutes. I'm not sure everybody is going to have time to talk, so I'm going to say [? 0:42:19], what I'd like Jack, since this is China, and I want to hear from you as to how the session went as well. And we'll keep going around, but after [? 0:42:31], we have Jack just because it is China and you had a special session. So [? 0:42:37].

WOMAN:

[? 0:42:41] for the record. So you will probably hear from me the last call for nomination committee comment. That May 1<sup>st</sup> is the deadline for a submission of [? 0:42:57], SOIs, a statement of interest so please there is a position for APRALO from APRALO for ALEC position.

So please, encourage good blessed candidates for our region to be represented, and there SOIs. Related to our meeting, I would like on behalf of everyone to thank Maureen for organizing such a wonderful showcase. And during several months, we were receiving back and forth from Maureen, okay, people so many people left, so many people left.

You did great job, so thank you very much. And a couple of just brief suggestions. For youth forum, I'm delighted to see this youth forum happening in parallel with ICANN meeting. What I would suggest for the next time, because we all know, Singapore is coming soon, so another APRALO possibility to be there.

Maybe we can organize joint session with this young kids with APRALO ALSs, and ALSs can learn a lot from the kids. So please, take this

---

suggestion into consideration, maybe we'll have just sharing experience with young people, to learn from them.

I'm not sure if that happen this time because I didn't get any information on that so. And thank you very much. I will be short.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you [? 0:44:29]. I want to Jack to actually talk about how this morning went, okay? And your experience of ICANN. Then we'll sort of go around. Maybe we'll start here. But we've got about ten minutes.

JACK:

So thank you for this special chance for me. So this is my very first time to attend ICANN meeting, and I think this is a very unforgettable experience for me, for young people to participate in internet governance. And also I say although this is a meeting helping China, but not a lot of Chinese people involved in our international hotel.

So that's, we should do after this meeting. So we At-Large structure, should do this. We are a bridge between the internet users and ICANN. We should try our best to make the ICANN past issues understood by the common users, and I think this is a key issue of multi-stakeholder model.

And also, I attend trademark clearing house and some Chinese At-Large structures this morning, and also I attend some other work group. I think I learn a lot from this meeting. So thank you Holly.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you Jack. Now [? 0:45:59] has had her two minutes. And you know, 30 seconds more.

WOMAN: Okay. Yeah. [? 0:46:05]. I think I feel more like at last, mainly because sort of I know feel more comfortable with saying who I am before I'm talking. And then, well one of my observation with this meeting is this time there are a lot of this strategy engagement meeting going on, which I don't feel like we are deeply engaged, with all of those ALAC strategy engagement process.

So that's like a part of the Rinalia's comment earlier. And so I think maybe from next meeting in Durbin, when this strategy engagement team designs and plans the future meeting in Durbin, maybe we can get more proactively engaged with those kinds of efforts.

But in general, I think sort of this Beijing meeting have been wonderful for our RALO. And again, I feel very sorry for not being very actively engaged with those [? 0:47:04] and some of our meetings, mainly because I wasn't having this internet history project interviews with some of people here in China.

Including Madame [Hoo 0:47:16] and Doctor [? 0:47:19] who personally introduced the internet network in China. So [laughs].

HOLLY RAICHE: You don't have any more time.

---

WOMAN: Okay. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks, Winthrop.

WINTHROP: Winthrop [? 0:47:35] from the Philippines. Yes, as a first timer, the first thing you notice is that there are a lot of things going on. There are several facets or niches to ICANN. At this point, after four days, at the very least I know which alphabet soup [laughter]... particular issue. Which one to bring it to.

At the very least. It's something that you have to at least know because otherwise, even if you go to the ICANN website, and you have something in mind, you won't know which of the several SOs or ACs to go to, to answer your question. So this is probably one of the first things that I have to bring back.

I tell them, oh, if somebody comes forward with a question regarding this, then I can tell them you have to go to ccNSO. That's where they handle these questions. It might help if at the website you have a small description of all the, an initial roadmap or directory.

HOLLY RAICHE: That's exactly what I was going to ask. What I'm hoping to get out of this discussion is how can we help each other become involved? I mean it was interesting... okay. After three meetings now involved, so what is it that we can do to help each other become involved?

---

The first meetings always, always, always difficult. So if you want to put some thoughts down into the meeting report on what would help, it would mean that we can actually start to help each other become involved. Would that make sense? Good. Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Thank you. This is Heidi from staff. Just some suggestions that we staff have seen from previous events, so from other RALOs that have had similar events, AFRALO they've kept the mailing list that you all are on for the APRALO Beijing events. They've kept that open and they will use that mailing list to follow up on actions, on action items that were discussed here, on issues, informing them of various meetings that are going on that you may wish to attend.

Working, virtual meetings, so that's one option. You all should also be subscribed to the A PACK discuss list. So it's up to you whether you want to use one list or the other. A lot of you, this has been a great chance for staff to see you for the first time, and to meet you. So it's up to you which list you prefer to use.

Another option that other RALOs have done is that they will do, they'll setup capacity, they'll continue capacity building sessions that you've had here during their monthly meetings. LACRALO have done that, and that's been very successful.

The number of people that have been on their monthly calls has increased and stayed at a good number. So that's something that you may wish to agree upon. Again, those would be briefing sessions, so



---

that would be bringing an expert out from the community, or from staff, on a particular issue, just for 20 minutes every monthly meeting.

So that's something, another option. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE:

Would people be interested in that? The other thing that has come out, by the way, was a suggestion that with every APRALO meeting, the first five minutes, one ALS will actually introduce themselves, to say this is who I am and this is what we do, this is what we've done in the past month. And that way we start to get to know each other a little bit better.

Does that, I see heads nodding. The temperature of the room is warm. We'll do that. Now look, we've got two minutes, and we've got a lot of people who haven't spoken. Do you want to spend another 15 minutes? The alternative is everybody on the meeting report, use that space to say this is what I got out of the meeting, these are the things that I think we could do better, these are the questions that I wish somebody had answered before I came.

Or these are the things that were actually done right. Because it will help us as APRALO, but what it means that we plan the next meeting in Durbin, that in fact we can start to listen to what worked and what didn't, and make the next meeting more useful, more user friendly. And actually that means that even if you don't go to Durbin, you might want to choose to participate remotely in the groups that interest you, to contribute.

---

So would people rather continue to go around the room, or just report back, and please use the meeting space and the good offices of Matt who is not just basically dead, and when he revives he would love to help you out. [? 0:52:44]

MATT ASHTIANI: Please speak into the microphone.

HOLLY RAICHE: I was asking if people wanted to go or not, so that's what we are voting on. Do people want to stay for an extra little while? Okay. An extra 10 minutes only.

MAN: [? 0:54:09] for transcript records. One of the meetings we attended was ISOC ICANN relationship meeting which happened on Sunday night, if I remember it correctly. So ISOC is trying to find out that what are the different ways in which the relationship between and the work between ISOC and ICANN deliver more.

So I think a similar meeting, or a similar working space from APRALO's [ID 0:53:35] can be made then we can also give a concrete input that what is expected of ISOC. And since most of our chapters, ALSs are ISOC chapters.

So I think a perfect synergy is there. So it's just a matter of time to find out what we really need to do, and then take it forward. Thanks.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. Holly for the transcript records. Next. Thanks.

MAN: [? 0:54:02] for transcript record. This is my first ALAC meeting, and I would like to thank all, Holly, Maureen, and everyone for welcoming as a representative of ISOC Malaysia into this group. And personally I learned a lot of new things.

And the most beneficial thing for me is to join every morning the briefing session, you know with a fellow, the joint fellow meeting with the APRALO, and because this is the first meeting for me, I need to learn a lot of things.

And the learning curve, I find it very steep. And the group that I joined, probably, mostly I joined is NCUC meeting discussion that probably is also another platform for engagement with the ISOC Malaysia. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. Go ahead.

MAN: [? 0:55:26] from ISOC Taipei. Actually I join ICANN meeting several times, and ICANN meeting get a surprise to learn a lot of things. However, I think some of the issue maybe we can use in the social network for example, maybe the Facebook group. Our group, then we can follow some issue.

---

And the [? 0:55:55] is we did not, we can remember each one looks like, yeah. Because it's very hard to take a photo to all of us, yeah. Thanks.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you.

JOSEPH: Joseph [? 0:56:12] for the record from ISOC Hong Kong. I'm a first timer here, so when I first received an email from Maureen, looking at these schedules, thinking about what the hell [laughter] is a four day fully schedule. But I can report to you that I attend all of them. [Applause]

A part from the alphabetical soup that we have to drink every day, and bring the right kind of soup that we drink every day, I enjoy every morning the wakeup call, in the 7:30 for the joint APRALO and ALS sessions.

And with that freshen up, I think I can carry on and somehow in this couple of days, I think I will be involved in IDN trademark clearing house, because I was a directing dot HK, which is totally relevant to this thing. And also the new gTLD because that's my CEO briefing me that that will be something happening over there.

But I'm totally amazed by the multi-stakeholder model, that is a very refreshing, that is a very good thing for the academics to pursue. Okay. So I finish here.

HOLLY RAICHE:

We've got... Heidi has got a brilliant idea, which is have a working group chair come on a meeting and just talk about what's happening in that working group so people who are... And they can take us sort of pre Paul, what is it that you want to talk about, or what is the issue of the day, and have a briefing for that as well.

Okay. Now Jack, you've already talked. Janice?

JANICE LEE:

Okay. This is Janice Lee form [Mount Mission 0:57:56]. I just want to share with everybody what we have the [? 0:57:59], we did... Okay. So my mission is I just want to share with everybody, we have organized a youth forum, actually discussing about the applicant support program.

And we found that is a really good idea to engage the youth especially, because they have prepared before these meetings a lot on these issues especially. And after coming to this ICANN meetings, they actually raised some interesting ideas and suggestions about how to improve the applicant support program.

And they found it more relevant when they attend the At-Large new gTLD working group, and they become more eager to join these sort of working group. So I think what Heidi just mentioned about the capacity building during the monthly call, so that it can introduce some current working groups, what are they working on, and so that other ALS, they can know what is going on and they can study some of the topics that interest them, and it will get them more involved in the ICANN, where to come, I think. So.

---

HOLLY RAICHE: That's good. Thank you.

JANICE LEE: And one more thing. I think next time, what [? 0:59:08] has mentioned about the Singapore meeting, I think for the APRALO, I think we really need to have this youth forum engaged so we can get more different ALS youth representatives joining or other ALS representatives as well. Thanks.

HOLLY RAICHE: [? 0:59:26]

MAN: [? 0:59:30] from ISOC Taipei. When my post tell me that he willing to offer me a free trip to Beijing, I said [laughs] this is a wonderful chance, why not? ISOC is just like an academic conference. I usually been to. [Laughter]

...quite different, okay? I have to wake up at seven [laughter]. Is really killing me, and it drive me crazy. [Laughter] but I found that this is quite a nice place. Those people are like family, I like you all, really. Indeed.

And I should stop writing youth lists and borrowing academic paper and to participate in ICANN in the future. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: We look forward to it. Thank you. [? 1:00:21].

---

MAN: Thank you Holly. And thank you all. This is my 35<sup>th</sup> ICANN meeting. I stopped coming at ICANN meetings at Brussels 2010, at 36<sup>th</sup>. I still like what you guys have done, ICANN provided funding, I was able to come. I was not sure, and I'm not still too sure if I will continue. I will make a decision soon.

I've been busy on the IGF. I'm also very busy with domestic ccTLD issue, the oversight and governance, and also this disaster thing. It's so refreshing to see many new faces. That's great. And I appreciate all the works of Holly, and the staff, and all the others for the past three years that I have no idea what you guys did.

But, I have one request for APRALO to consider some individual membership to be in place. So that I can dissolve my ALS, which is not functional. There is no due diligence on the ALS, that is not fair for all. So I think we should really reconsider that. At least the RALO level, if not the entire global level.

And I think for the national and regional level, we really need to have bottom up if we are to uphold that multi-stakeholder. How many countries are there really, these multi-stakeholder models is exercised? The government and private sector together and the community together with the civil society?

Very, very few. If you only reconsider the global level, we may lose separate building. That's my take. Thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. And we will be talking the ALAC level about individual membership. You've got the floor, and we've got about 30 seconds

---

apiece, because I'm sure everybody wants to finally get away from this room.

MAN: This is [? 1:02:11] from Taiwan. This is my first time being here. And I really appreciate the briefing session early every morning. And I think it's very beneficial for us to, as new comers and it's very great place to get to know how the ICANN and how the ALAC operate. And it's also good for our health.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thank you. [? 1:02:45]

MAN: I'm not sure how many ICANN meetings I've been to before. I've been to several ones, I've been through the different positions through APRALO and ICANN. And like [? 1:03:02] I've been away for the past three years, on totally unrelated matters.

But it's good to see so many new faces here. I couldn't believe the other day when it was announced that this was the APRALO meeting, and I was like well, I only know half a dozen people here and so [laughs] it's certainly grown over the past three years.

I think from being active in APRALO, then leaving, then coming back, I see there is an issue there of making APRALO relevant and the issues that we're debating is, how do we take that [mis respect 1:03:33] to the community and say to them, well, you don't have to be a god to help



---

make these decisions, you can just be normal like us and come and join APRALO.

So I think that that's perhaps one of the challenges that we face at the moment. Thanks.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks. [? 1:03:50]

WOMAN; [? 1:03:51] Hunter from Cook Islands. I'm a GAC member, but I haven't attended any of the GAC meetings because I found this, my first time at the ALS and ALS sort of senator very interesting. And I was just saying to Maureen that it will be good if we can go back home and reach out to our community and also to our internet service provider, because there is some discussions going on at ICANN meetings that can benefit the country if representatives are seen from our telecom operators.

I just want to comment also on what Malaysia said about the steep learning curve, because although I've been to ICANN before, I'm still finding it difficult to understand a lot of the discussions going on. And I also agree with Korea and the Philippines in terms of important meetings going on at the same time.

Like right now we have ICANN public forum, so thank you.

HOLLY RAICHE: Thanks. And without further ado, Maureen, you don't want to say anything, do you? She doesn't want to say anything. I don't want to say

---

anything. I think what we want to do is let people off... [? 1:05:07]  
you're not one of us, are you?

She hasn't even attended meetings and she wants to talk. Right. Is the temperature of the room that she gets 30 seconds? Thank you.

WOMAN:

[? 1:05:26] Clark. Thank you for the opportunity to say hi. I'm sorry I have not been able to come all week. And I will slow down with respect to the interpreters. I apologize for not being able to attend any of the meetings earlier this week.

It's been a very hectic time for me recently. As you may know, I'm the president of the Internet Society in Australia, the Australian chapter. I also work for a consumer organization in Australia called I Can, that represents consumers in the telecommunications internet space.

And I sit on the ISOC Board of Trustees, and we are having some really busy meetings over the next few days. So I look forward to hearing any input from any of you, on any of the related topics there. And I'm really pleased to see a number of you again.

And I'm so glad also that you've had such productive meetings this week. And the showcase, I'm devastated to have missed that. It sounds fantastic, and thank you again everybody who participated, and Maureen too.

HOLLY RAICHE:

With no further ado, you can...oh. Edmon. Edmon you're holding everybody up. Go on.

---

EDMON CHUNG: I hope it's important enough. So two things, one I'm hoping that people would join some of the working groups at ALAC. If we can send you the list of the working groups, and sign yourself up, that's going to be useful. So if we can get somebody to send them, or even as you go out, that's one thing.

The other thing is I'm wondering if we can invite our friends from mainland China to use Chinese to thank our interpreters.

HOLLY RAICHE: Excellent idea. Right? Jack?

JACK: That good.

HOLLY RAICHE: [Laughter] And that doesn't count.

EDMON CHUNG: Or from Taipei.

HOLLY RAICHE: Whatever. Just say thank you to the interpreters.

MAN: Yeah. Maybe I just using the Chinese to thank, yeah. Hello everyone. On behalf of China, Hong Kong, and Taiwan, we would like to express

---

our gratitude towards the interpreters and all the technicians as well as ICANN staff. [Applause]

HOLLY RAICHE:

Thank you to the interpreters [applause]. To the technical staff [applause]. And particularly to Matt and Heidi who must be dead on their feet. [Applause] Thank you everybody and see you in Durbin, but we will talk a lot beforehand.